ORDER SHEET

WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Present-

The Hon'ble Justice Ranjit Kumar Bag & The Hon'ble Subesh Kumar Das

Case No -OA 666 OF 2012

Bipul Kumar Saha Vs The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Date of order. 1 27 24.07.2018 For the Applicant : Mr. S. N. Ray,	Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
For the Applicant: Mr. S. N. Ray, Learned Advocate. For the State respondents: Mr. A.L. Basu, Learned Advocate. The applicant has prayed for direction upon the respondents to give the applicant promotion from the date of his eligibility for promotion after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of	Date of order.	_	_
Learned Advocate. For the State respondents: Mr. A.L. Basu, Learned Advocate. The applicant has prayed for direction upon the respondents to give the applicant promotion from the date of his eligibility for promotion after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of	1		
For the State respondents: Mr. A.L. Basu, Learned Advocate. The applicant has prayed for direction upon the respondents to give the applicant promotion from the date of his eligibility for promotion after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of	27		
Learned Advocate. The applicant has prayed for direction upon the respondents to give the applicant promotion from the date of his eligibility for promotion after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of	24.07.2018	Learned Advocate.	
the applicant promotion from the date of his eligibility for promotion after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		·	
the applicant promotion from the date of his eligibility for promotion after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of			
after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		The applicant has prayed for direction upon the respondents to give	
forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		the applicant promotion from the date of his eligibility for promotion	
for consideration and recommendation for promotion. The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		after quashing order dated April 26, 2012 by which names were	
The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		forwarded by the Department to Public Service Commission, West Bengal	
Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		for consideration and recommendation for promotion.	
the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		The applicant joined in the post of Sub-Assistant Engineer (M & E) at	
Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		Teesta Mechanical Division, Siliguri on April 15, 1997. The contention of	
dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		the applicant is that he passed departmental examination conducted by	
Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		Public Service Commission, West Bengal on the basis of Notification	
Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		dated March 4, 2009 published by Public Service Commission, West	
applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		Bengal and, therefore, he is eligible for promotion to the post of Assistant	
Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		Engineer w.e.f. December 28, 2010. The further contention of the	
departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		applicant is that he should have been promoted to the post of Assistant	
Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		Engineer before his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar as he passed	
effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		departmental examination before his immediate senior, Debasis	
during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of		Majumdar. The grievance of the applicant is that without giving him	
		effect of promotion from the year 2010 he has been given promotion	
actual joining in the post of Assistant Engineer on the basis of Notification		during pendency of the present application with effect from the date of	
		actual joining in the post of Assistant Engineer on the basis of Notification	
dated December 26, 2013.		dated December 26, 2013.	

ORDER SHEET

Mr. S.N. Ray, Learned Counsel for the applicant contends that the applicant was eligible for promotion in the year 2010 for passing out the departmental examination. Had the name of the applicant been forwarded to the Public Service Commission by the concerned department in the year 2010, he would have been promoted long before promotion of his immediate senior in the gradation list (namely Debasis Majumdar) and the benefit of that promotion would have been given from the year 2010. On the other hand, Mr. Basu, Learned Counsel representing the State respondents contends that the case of the applicant has been considered on proper time and the applicant has not been superseded by his junior placed in the gradation list. He further submits that Debasis Majumdar who was placed above the applicant in the gradation list got the promotion in the post of Assistant Engineer before promotion of the applicant and thereby the applicant has not been discriminated at any point of time.

Having heard Learned Counsel representing both parties and on consideration of materials on record, we find that the applicant is placed at serial no. 76 in the gradation list (annexure A to the original application) while one Debasis Majumdar who has not been impleaded as respondent in the present application is placed at serial no. 75 in the said gradation list. The position of the applicant in the gradation list and that of his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar cannot change only because the applicant passed out departmental examination prior to passing out of departmental examination by his immediate senior. Nothing is on record to indicate that the applicant is more meritorious that his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar. In the absence of any document before us to establish that the department should have considered the case of the applicant bypassing the seniority of his immediate senior Debasis Majumdar, we are unable to accept the contention made on behalf of the applicant that the case of the applicant should have been forwarded to the Public Service Commission before forwarding the case of his immediate senior, Debasis Majumdar. We

ORDER SHEET

	T a m		
	fully accept the submission made of		
	the applicant has not been discrim		
	the post of Assistant Engineer.		
	In view of our above findings, w		
	applicant. Accordingly, the present		
	(Dr. S.K. Das)	(R.K. Bag)	
	Member (A)	Member (J)	
	Wiember (A)	Wielliber (3)	
<u>Rajib</u>			